



Edwin M. Lee, Mayor
Philip A. Ginsburg, General Manager

Date: October 15, 2015

To: Recreation and Park Commission
Planning Commission

Through: Philip A. Ginsburg, General Manager
Dawn Kamalanathan, Director, Capital & Planning Division

From: Stacy Bradley, Deputy Director of Planning, Capital & Planning Division

Subject: 363 6th Street - Evaluation of Shadow on Gene Friend Recreation Center

Gene Friend Recreation Center – Shadow Impact from Proposed Project at 363 6th Street.

AGENDA ITEM 1A: Discussion and possible joint action by the Planning Commission and Recreation and Park Commission to raise the cumulative shadow limit for Gene Friend Recreation Center, pursuant to the jointly-approved Planning Code Section 295 Implementation Memo adopted in 1989, in order to accommodate new shadow cast by the 363 6th Street project, and adoption of findings under the California Environmental Quality Act.

AGENDA ITEM 1B: Discussion and possible action by the Recreation and Park Commission to adopt a resolution to recommend to the Planning Commission that the new shadow cast on Gene Friend Recreation Center by the proposed project at 363 6th Street will not be adverse to the use of the park, as required by Planning Code Section 295 (the Sunlight Ordinance).

Background

Planning Code Section 295 was adopted in 1985 in response to voter-approved Proposition K, which required Planning Commission disapproval of any structure greater than 40 feet in height that cast a shadow on property under the jurisdiction of the Recreation and Park Department, unless the Planning Commission found the shadow would not be significant.

To implement Planning Code Section 295 and Proposition K, the Planning Commission and Recreation and Park Commission in 1989 jointly adopted a memorandum (“1989 Memo”) establishing qualitative criteria for evaluating shadow impacts as well as Absolute Cumulative Limits (“ACLs”) for certain parks. ACLs are “shadow” budgets that establish absolute cumulative limits for additional shadows expressed as a percentage of Theoretically Available Annual



Sunlight (“TAAS”) on a park with no adjacent structures present. To date, ACL standards have been established for 14 downtown parks. An ACL standard of zero percent (0%) has been adopted for Gene Friend Recreation Center, previously called South of Market Park.

The 1989 Memo sets forth qualitative criteria to determine when a shadow would be significant as well as information on how to quantitatively measure shadow impacts. Qualitatively, shadow impacts are evaluated based on the following: 1) existing shadow profiles, 2) times of day, 3) seasons in the year, 4) location of the new shadow, 5) size and duration of new shadows, and (6) the public good served by buildings casting a new shadow. Quantitatively, new shadows are to be measured by the additional annual amount of square foot-hours (sfh) as a percent of TAAS.

To exceed the limits for one of the 14 parks named in the 1989 Memo, the Recreation and Park Commission and Planning Commission must jointly agree to increase the ACL established by the 1989 Memo. A determination to raise an ACL for a park is based on qualitative factors and whether the additional shadow cast would have an adverse impact on the park.

Project Description

The Project site is located at 363 6th Street in San Francisco, California (Assessor’s Block 3753, Lot 079), at the corner of 6th Street and Clara Street. The Project site has 160 linear feet of frontage along Clara Street and 80 linear feet of frontage along 6th Street. It is currently developed with a two-story building that is used as a church. See Attachment A for Project Location.

The Project proposes to demolish the existing building on site and construct a 104-unit, multi-family residential building comprised of 59 two-bedroom units, 24 one-bedroom units and 21 studio units, 49 off-street parking spaces and 109 bicycle spaces. The Project will have 12 below-market-rate units onsite for rental through the Mayor’s Office of Housing. The proposed building would have a roof height of approximately 85 feet with a four-foot high parapet at the perimeter of the roof and a 16-foot elevator penthouse enclosure. See Attachment B for Site Renderings and Plans.

Surrounding Properties and Neighborhood

The Project site is located in the South of Market (“SOMA”) neighborhood, within the Mixed-Use Residential Zoning District, the 85-X Height and Bulk District, and the SOMA Youth and Family Special Use District. It is adjacent to a vacant lot and single-story office building (345 6th Street) to the northwest. To the southwest, across 6th Street is a row of multi-story mixed-use structures with heights ranging from 13 to 52 feet. To the southeast, across Clara Street, is a vacant lot with an abandoned structure in the corner at Clara Street and 6th Street.

Park Description

Gene Friend Recreation Center is a 1.02 acre park (44,618 square feet) located at 270 6th Street (Assessor's Block 3731, Lots 010, 011, 012 and 111), two blocks from the proposed project site. It is bounded by a two-story, 26-foot-high private property on the northwest, Harriet Street on the west, Folsom Street on the south, and 6th Street on the east.

Gene Friend Recreation Center provides a mix of outdoor and indoor recreation space. It includes a sports court, playground and green field to the west along Harriet Street and a 24- to 34-foot-high structure (with a 16,835 square-foot footprint (the "Rec Center Building") to the east along 6th Street. The Rec Center Building includes a full indoor gymnasium, activity room, weight room and auditorium and occupies approximately $\frac{3}{4}$ of the 6th Street frontage. The Rec Center and playgrounds serve an area where open space and recreation opportunities are limited. The facility is used by school children, seniors and people who live and work in the neighborhood.

A 9-foot-tall fence with guardrails encircles Gene Friend Recreation Center and is locked at night. Access to the park is provided via three gates: one at the corner of Folsom and 6th Streets, another on Harriet Street, and the third on 6th Street. See Attachment C for a Park Diagram. The park is open from 9:00 am until 9:00 pm from Tuesday to Friday. In addition, the Rec Center is open from 9:00 am to 5:00 pm on Saturdays. The facility is available for rentals on Sunday and Mondays and offers after school programming for children on Mondays from 3 pm to 5 pm.

Gene Friend Recreation Center is currently undergoing an improvement process in partnership with Trust for Public Land (TPL). RPD and TPL have embarked on a feasibility study and concept design for the Gene Friend Recreation Center. The goals for this study and design is to set the stage for renovation to create a safe, welcoming, modern resource for individuals, families and children of different ages. A concept plan is expected in the beginning of 2016.

Analysis of Project Impact on Gene Friend Recreation Center

A Shadow Analysis, prepared by CADP and reviewed by the Planning Department, analyzed the potential shadow impacts of the 363 6th Street Project. The proposed project would add 46,297.80 sfh of shadow on Gene Friend Recreation Center. This is an increase of 0.02788% in shadow. See Attachment D for CADP's Shadow Analysis.

Shadows on Recreation and Park Department land are measured in sfh to identify time and shape of the shadow. Gene Friend Recreation Center has 166,041,425.20 sfh of TAAS. Shadows currently exist on Gene Friend Recreation Center in the morning and evening hours. The existing shadow load, including the shadow from the Rec Center Building, is 38,089,089.18 sfh annually. This is approximately 22.94% of the total TAAS for Gene Friend Recreation Center.

Please note, the footprint of the Recreation Center Building (building footprint only and NOT the shadow created by the building) creates an additional existing shadow load of 62,649,769 sfh annually. This is approximately 37.73% of the total TAAS for Gene Friend Recreation Center. The total existing shadow load including the footprint of the Gene Friend Recreation Center is 100,738,858.17 sfh annually. This is approximately 60.67% of the total TAAS for Gene Friend Recreation Center. Because the Recreation Center Building itself is always in shadow, it is not factored into the existing shadow load.

The Shadow Analysis was based on a June 21st to December 20th solar year to provide a sample of representative sun angles throughout the solar year. Sun angles during the other side of the calendar year mirror the sun angles analyzed so a multiplier was used to put the results into calendar year units. The use of a multiplier does not change the percentages or findings of the report. In accordance with Section 295 and the 1989 Memo, the time of analysis starts one hour after sunrise and concludes one hour before sunset, or the “solar day”. The Shadow Analysis concluded the following findings:

- The new shadow from the proposed project would occur 20 discreet days between September 27 to March 15 from Sunrise +1 hour with all new shadow gone by 8:41 am.
- The longest duration of new shadow would be approximately 23 minutes and the average shadow would be cast for less than 12 minutes.
- The largest shadow cast by the proposed project is 6,024 sf on October 25 / February 15 for approximately 8 minutes from Sunrise +1 hour (7:30 am) to 7:38 am.
- All new shadows would be cast before the park currently opens and are within the southeastern edge, which has a path and a portion of the grassy field adjacent to the corner of 6th Street and Folsom Street.

Gene Friend Recreation Center is currently shadowed 22.94% of the time. This project would add an additional 0.028% for a total of 22.97% of shadow. See Attachment E for the Maximum New Shadow on October 25.

The following tables summarize the quantitative and qualitative summary of the shadow analysis:

Quantitative Summary of Shadow Findings

TAAS	166,041,425 sfh
Existing Shadow	38,089,089 sfh
New Shadow	46,297 sfh
Total Shadow with Proposed Project	38,135,386 sfh
Park Size	1.02 acres
Increase	0.028%

Qualitative Summary of Shadow Findings

Time of Day	Just after Sunrise +1 hour
Time of Year	20 days from September - March
Duration of Shadow	Ranges from 5 minutes to 23 minutes Average is 12 minutes
Size of Shadow	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Greatest amount of shadow = 803 sfh • Largest footprint = 6,024 sf • Duration is 8 minutes, shading approximately 13% of total park area between 7:30-7:38am
Location of Shadow	Walkways and small portion of the grassy field adjacent to the corner of 6 th Street and Folsom Street.

Cumulative Shading Analysis

In addition to 363 6th Street, there are four known projects in this area that could potentially shade Gene Friend Recreation Center: 999 Folsom St, 345 6th St, 988 Harrison St, and 980 Folsom St. 988 Harrison Street is not expected to have any new shadow on Gene Friend Rec Center and 999 Folsom St is pending its review; however, preliminary results show little to no new shadow impact from the building.

Initial results for 999 Folsom indicate a new shadow load of 1,868,910.14 sfh of new shadow or 1.13% and would occur from February to November. The largest shadow would be 21,444 sf on September 27/March 15. This project is still under review by the Planning Department and this analysis is subject to change. Please note: This project is expected to shadow Victoria Manalo Draves Park as well.

Results for 345 6th Street indicate a new shadow load of 113,616.94 sfh of new shadow or 0.07% and would occur from September to April. The largest shadow would be 8,949 sf on October 11/March 1.

Combined, these projects could yield an additional 2,028,824.88 sfh or 1.23% new shadow. However, only 363 6th Street is ready to move forward with its project approvals. See Attachment F for a map and chart of cumulative projects.

Impact Fees and other Public Benefits

The proposed project would comply with the Inclusionary Affordable Housing Program under Planning Code Section 415 et seq. by providing 12% on-site inclusionary housing. In addition, it will contribute approximately \$1.8 million in impact fees for new public infrastructure and capital improvements to schools.

The Project Sponsor has provided the San Francisco Parks Alliance two monetary donations to support events and programming at Gene Friend Recreation Center: \$10,000 for youth

scholarship funds and \$2,075 to sponsor the October movie night. The Project Sponsor has also supported a Filipino heritage plaque and unveiling ceremony at Victoria Manalo Draves Park.

As explained in a letter from the Project Sponsor dated September 30, 2015 (see Attachment G – Community Benefits Letter), the Project Sponsor is working with WalkSF and neighbors along Clara Street to implement the street improvements recently cut from the SOMA Alleyway Improvement project along Clara Street. These streetscape improvement measures include furnishing zones for greening on both sides of Clara Street, and providing traffic calming circles to improve pedestrian safety.

Project Outreach

The Project Sponsor has reached out to several community groups and local businesses. Details and information related to Project Sponsor's community outreach is included in the letter from the Project Sponsor in Attachment G. See Attachment H for Comment Letters on the project.

Environmental Review

On October 2, 2015, the Planning Department determined that this project was exempt from environmental review through a Community Plan Exemption (CPE). The CPE can be found on the Planning Department's website: http://sfmea.sfplanning.org/2011.0586E_CPE.pdf.

Staff Recommendation

Acting to raise the cumulative shadow limit for a park and making a finding on a shadow impact from a proposed development project is a policy decision for the Commission; as such, staff does not have a recommendation. In the event that the Commissions acts to raise the cumulative shadow limit for Gene Friend Recreation Center and to make a finding of no adverse impact, staff has prepared two separate draft resolutions.

Specifically, the resolution provided in Attachment I would raise the cumulative shadow limit for Gene Friend Recreation Center by 0.02788% of the TAAS, amending the jointly-approved Planning Code Section 295 Implementation Memo adopted in 1989, in order to accommodate new shadow cast by the project at 363 6th Street (Agenda Item 1A). The resolution provided in Attachment J would recommend that the Planning Commission find that the net new shadow cast by the proposed Project on Gene Friend Recreation Center will not be adverse to the use of the park, pursuant to Planning Code Section 295 (Agenda Item 1B).

Supported By:

WalkSF and various neighbors and organizations, See Attachment H – Comment Letters

Opposed By:

See Attachment H – Comment Letters for neighbors who have emailed in opposition to the project.

Attachments:

Attachment A: Project Location Map

Attachment B: Site Renderings

Attachment C: Park Diagram

Attachment D: CADP Shadow Analysis

Attachment E: Day of Maximum Impact

Attachment F: Cumulative Projects Chart and Map

Attachment G: Community Benefits Letter

Attachment H: Comment Letters

Attachment I: Resolution for Agenda 1A

Attachment J: Resolution for Agenda 1B